

*L. Ts. Vakhovskyi SI "Luhansk Taras Shevchenko National University"*

*O. A. Bocharova, Andrzej Frycz Modrzewski Krakow University (Poland)*

## **SHADOW EDUCATION IN UKRAINE AND THE PROBLEM OF EQUAL EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES**

Vakhovskyi L. Ts, Bocharova O. A.

Shadow education in Ukraine and the problem of equal educational opportunities

The essence of shadow education is revealed in the article, its content, forms, methods as well as prevalence in Ukraine are examined and the consequences of the spread of private supplementary occupations, their influence on ensuring equality of educational opportunities are shown.

Shadow education is seen as paid educational services provided to students in addition to school subjects. It is emphasized that the "shadow education" metaphor is used to show that private additional education copies the basic school education, follows it as a shadow.

Based on a survey of 300 first-year students of the Lugansk Taras Shevchenko National University (Starobelsk), data on the prevalence of additional private education in Ukraine was received not in the national but in the regional dimension. This made it possible to get a more accurate idea of the external factors that contribute to its spread. The number of first-year students who used the services of private supplementary education was established, the specifics of the content, forms and methods of private supplementary education were clarified, as well as the motivation of students for obtaining additional educational services. The connection between tutoring sessions and the school curriculum is shown in the article.

It is proved that the shadow education, which in Ukraine exists primarily in the form of "tutoring", is steadily spreading, and significantly affects the academic achievements of students in state secondary schools and contributes to the increase in social inequality and the inequality of educational opportunities.

*Key words:* shadow education, tutoring, private additional education, equality of educational opportunities.

The problem of access to education and equality of educational opportunities, which is particularly actual at the level of higher education, is one of the most urgent and important in the modern world. It is no coincidence that the United Nations

Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), starting in the 1990s, devotes considerable attention to the definition of the strategy for reforming higher education. It was during this period that there was an increase in socio-economic inequality and differences in access to higher education not only in developing countries, but also in the most developed and rich ones.

In 1995, UNESCO published a program document "Reform and Higher Education Development" and held a number of regional meetings, which became a kind of preparation for the World Conference on Higher Education in Paris in 1998. The forum adopted a final document entitled "World Declaration on Higher Education for the 21st Century: Visions and Actions", which included ensuring equity of access to higher education in accordance with the abilities, capabilities, efforts and perseverance of those who want to get such education. Particular emphasis was made on the fact that there must not be any discrimination to get higher education on the basis of race, sex, language and religion, as well as any economic, cultural or social differences or physical disadvantages [1, p. 33].

Unfortunately, in our country, perhaps, under the influence of the Soviet past, it is considered by inertia that the problem of equality of educational opportunities is resolved. As a result, it is beyond the attention of scientists and educators. However, in the context of radical socio-economic and political reforms, the development of private education, the growth of economic inequality of the population, the problem of equality of educational opportunities becomes extremely actual in Ukraine.

One of the manifestations of a private initiative in the educational sphere is the so-called shadow education, which has a long history and is widely distributed at the present stage in many countries of the world.

The problems of shadow education are actively studied by foreign scholars D. Baker, M. Bray, C. Lykins, I. Mori I., J. Tan and others.

In the last decade, Ukrainian researchers have been involved in the scientific development of this issue. In 2006, within the Education Support Program of the Open Society Institute, the nature, causes and consequences of private education in post-socialist countries were explored. Ukrainian researchers L. Grinevich,

A. Toropova, T. Pilnik, L. Sereda, V. Gerashevich examined the factors that determine the demand for private education in Ukraine, the impact of private education on the state education system, and substantiated the relevant recommendations [2]. Tutoring as a pedagogical phenomenon was considered by S. Budna, O. Onishchenko, I. Podlasy, N. Simonova and others. Economic aspects of tutoring as a component of shadow education were studied by O. Khmelevskaya, N. Sas, et al.

Issues related to ensuring equal access to education are studied mainly by comparativist pedagogues (Boris Zhelezov, O. Zabolotna, L. Zagoruiko, O. Lokshina, G. Cherednichenko, S. Shishkin, O. Yarskaya-Smirnova and others. ) In particular, the dissertation of L. Zagoruiko is devoted to the study of strategies to ensure equal educational opportunities for young people in Scandinavian countries [3]. O. Lokshina considered ways of implementing the idea of expanding access to education and equalizing educational opportunities in the countries of the European Union [4].

The conducted analysis of scientific literature showed that scientists focus on the study of individual forms of shadow education and only touch on issues related to the social consequences of this phenomenon.

The purpose of the article is to reveal the essence of shadow education, to characterize its content, forms, methods, the extent of the services of shadow education in Ukraine, and to show its consequences in terms of ensuring equality of educational opportunities.

First of all, it would be appropriate to determine the meaning of the term "shadow education", since in modern scientific literature it is interpreted ambiguously. We will rely on the definition of M. Bray and C. Licking, which characterizes shadow education as a paid education service, which is provided in addition to the subjects of the curriculum of general education institutions (in our country this phenomenon is more commonly known as "tutoring") [5, p. 1]. It should be noted that the metaphor for "shadow education" is used to show that private supplementary education copies the basic school education, followed by it as a shadow, changing its content in unison with changing the content of school

education. Shadow education does not include sports sections, courses, free counseling.

M. Bray has repeatedly emphasized the fact that shadow education as one of the types of private supplementary education always imitates the content of school education. He believes that there are at least four reasons for using the "shadow education" metaphor. First, this type of private supplementary education exists only because there is a basic education in secondary schools; secondly, changing the content and forms of school education leads to a change in the content and forms of educational services provided by tutors; thirdly, in almost all societies, focus is on mainstream education, not on its shadow; fourthly, the features of shadow education are much less expressive than the peculiarities of the main system, and therefore their study and analysis are difficult [6, p. 1]

Speaking about "shadow education", we should not carry out analogies with the term "shadow economy", which has only a negative connotation, since it reflects morally questionable, unauthorized practices, that is, types of economic activity prohibited by law and not taken into account in official statistics. We focus on the pedagogical content of "shadow education," and fully support M. Bray and C. Likins' opinion that this phenomenon has both positive and negative aspects. Positive is the fact that additional educational services contribute to personal academic success, offer more diverse educational resources, more convenient training schedule, help students who learn the educational material slowly to or keep up with their peers, and able learners – to achieve a higher level of knowledge acquisition. The negative effects of shadow education are manifested in the fact that it contributes to the strengthening of social inequality, and, hence, the inequality of educational opportunities for students when entering higher educational institutions, reduces the efficiency of public school education, takes away free time for children, which could be used for sports or other interesting activities necessary for their comprehensive development [5, p. 2].

O. Khmelevskaya considers "tutoring" in Ukraine as a component of shadow education. Relying on the study of foreign authors, she emphasized that shadow

education is determined by the following three parameters: it is private; additional; academic [7, p. 41].

In general, agreeing with the opinion of the author, we note that tutoring in Ukraine is not an integral part of shadow education, but rather the main form of shadow education, and it will not be a big mistake to use these two concepts as identical.

M. Bray drew attention to the fact that reliable data on shadow education is difficult to obtain for several reasons. First, extra classes are often held informally, and tutor teachers do not want to advertise their activities. Secondly, students may hide information about the number of additional classes they receive, because for various reasons they can be ashamed of their peers [8, p. 516].

That is why, in spite of the fact that Ukrainian researchers have already pointed out the quantitative indicators that characterize the shadow education in Ukraine, in 2017, we conducted a survey of the first year students of Luhansk Taras Shevchenko National University (Starobelsk). We realize that the sample of more than 300 people is not representative enough, since it does not fully reflect the characteristics of the general population. The vast majority of respondents (students of the evacuated Lugansk Taras Shevchenko National University) live in the eastern region of the country and are mainly from villages, urban-type settlements and small towns. At the same time, we believe that the data received in general correctly reflect the general tendency for the functioning of shadow education. Some quantitative indicators may even be understated, due to the fact that in larger cities, the services of private teachers are used more often.

We also proceeded from the fact that it is important to consider indicators of the prevalence of additional private education in Ukraine not only in the national dimension (Ukrainian researchers have already reported this), but also in the regional one – to have a more accurate picture of the external factors that contribute to its spread.

The first question block of questions, which was proposed to the survey participants, concerned quantitative indicators of shadow education. First of all, we

tried to find out how many respondents used the services of private supplementary education. By conducting the survey, we decided to contact the students of the first year of the university. The main reason for this choice was that freshmen, unlike pupils in a secondary school, could be more objective because they had already graduated from high school and did not depend on teachers who carried out additional classes. It was found that 58% of respondents used the services of private tutors while studying at a secondary school. This quantitative indicator shows the current demand for additional private education.

The percentage of students trained with tutors in general is higher in Ukraine, since in our sample, as noted earlier, there are no freshmen studying at secondary schools in large cities. Thus, according to the data provided by L. Grinevich A. Toropova and others, in 2006 more than 80% of freshmen used the services of additional private education during the last school year (43, 4% – in the form of private lessons of tutors; 11, 6% for preparatory courses, 24, 1% for private lessons and preparatory courses) from one or more subjects [2, p. 310].

The obtained data are quite comparable with the quantitative indicators characterizing shadow education in other post-Soviet countries. For example, in Kazakhstan, additional private educational services were provided to 59, 9% of university freshmen (1004 people were interviewed), in Georgia – 76% (839 people were interviewed), Tajikistan – 64, 8% (998 people were interviewed) [5, p. 5-9].

We also set the task to find out at what stage of secondary school the students began to use the services of tutors, which was the length of the course, intensity of classes, the cost of private additional training.

The answers to the question "When did you first contact for private tutors?" were distributed as follows: in elementary school (1–4 forms) – 7,1%; in middle school (5–9 forms) – 23,7%; in high school (10–11 forms) – 27,2%. At the same time, the general length of using the services of private tutors in 20, 7% of respondents was several months, but less than a year, 12, 4% – 1 year, 15, 4% – 2 years, 5, 9% – 3 years, at 3% – more than 3 years. The intensity of studies with private teachers is also evidenced by data on their frequency: 11, 2% of respondents

used the services of tutors once a week, 2 times a week – 33, 1%, 3 times – 11, 2%. The duration of one lesson with a private tutor was mostly one astronomical hour (32, 5%) and even more than an hour (19, 5%). The cost of one class ranged from 50 to 100 UAH.

It can be stated that the vast majority of students begin to feel the need for additional classes in the second and third grades of the secondary school (which in Ukraine is middle and high school), using the services of private teachers (tutors) for about one year, studying twice a week. It is clear that Ukrainian students use tutor services before some academic final tests (exams, tests) and experience significant additional workload.

The second block of questions was related to the content, forms and methods of private supplementary education, the connection of training sessions of tutors with the school curriculum. In the course of the survey, we found out for which of these subjects students needed classes with private tutors. A somewhat of a "popularity rating" of educational disciplines in the system of private supplementary education is as follows: mathematics – 24, 5%, foreign language – 23%, Ukrainian language and literature – 19, 4%, history – 12, 2%, biology - 11,7%, chemistry – 5, 6%, geography – 2%, physics – 1, 5%.

It is not difficult to notice that when choosing subjects for additional education, not only of their complexity and the low level of teaching at school was taken into account, but also the need to obtain a certificate of academic discipline when joining an institution of higher education. The tendency to choose educational subjects in private supplementary education, which will facilitate the transition from one degree of education to another, is also observed in foreign countries [5, p. 13].

As we expected, the guideline for determining the content of classes with private teachers (tutors) was the curriculum. About 60% of respondents reported this. At the same time, more than 20% of students studied under the individual expanded program, and for another 20% their personal interest in certain topics and problems was taken into account. The fact that classes with tutors followed the school curriculum "like a shadow" is indicated by the data on the place of work of private

teachers (tutors), whose services were used by respondents. 74, 7% of such tutors worked in a public school where participants went to, 15, 9% were engaged in individual work activities, 7, 1% were professors of higher education institutions.

The most common form of organization of private supplementary education was individualized face-to-face training with a teacher. This was reported by 69% of respondents, 17, 9% of them received additional educational services in small groups, 6% – in the online mode. Online education is quite popular and common in modern private education, as it has no geographic boundaries and allows communication with tutors and students located in different cities and even countries and continents. The low percentage of survey participants who have benefited from additional online private tutoring is due, rather, to the poor quality of the Internet in the rural areas.

Answers to the second group of questions confirm the "shadow" and compensatory nature of private supplementary education in relation to school education. This is evidenced by the content of training sessions with tutors, prevalence among tutors the secondary schools teachers. Teaching methods in additional private education are more individualized and more effective in comparison with those in secondary schools. This is supported, in particular, by the fact that more than half of the respondents are fully satisfied or rather satisfied with the services of private teachers.

The third block of questions was related to the motivation of students in obtaining additional educational services. The answers to the question "What prompted you to contact private tutors?" were distributed as follows: low school education and its insufficient efficiency – 12, 2%; the desire to better prepare for External Independent Testing (EIT) 46, 6%; Low academic achievement during the academic year – 13%; desire to study the subject in depth – 21,4%; The initiative from relatives – 6, 9%. We also tried to find out under what conditions respondents would refuse the private education services. More than 40% of them indicated that such a condition is the abolition of the EIT, and more than 30% increase in the level of teaching at school. At the same time, 25, 7% of respondents believe that additional



private education complements school education, and they would not abandon it under any circumstances.

It can be argued that, firstly, the main motive for receiving the services of additional private education is the low level of school education and the desire to better prepare for an External Independent Testing, results of which give you the possibility of enrollment at a higher education establishment. Secondly, that the state secondary school cannot resolve this issue without the help of others. The vast majority of students consciously decide, without any external pressure, to use the services of private teachers (only over 7% of respondents indicated that their decision to take up additional classes was initiated by relatives).

As we can see students' dissatisfaction with the quality of general secondary education is the main reason for applying for additional private education services in other post-Soviet countries. According to the survey, 52, 7% of freshmen in Kazakhstan believe that they have been encouraged by low level of schooling before receiving additional lessons, while 48% mentioned the same reason in Georgia. In Armenia, only 11, 9% of secondary school graduates responded that school activities are quite sufficient for entry into higher education institutions [5, p. 27–28].

One of the most important social consequences of the spread of shadow education is the growing inequality of educational opportunities. During the survey, we invited respondents to identify the reasons for the refusal to use the services of private teachers. 38, 2% of them indicated that such reason is the high price for services of additional private education. This means that students whose parents are able to pay for the work of the tutors will be able to successfully complete the EIT and have competitive advantages in entering the higher education institutions.

The parents' willingness to spend their own funds on additional education of children is regarded by researchers as "alternative sources of financing education" as "public activity in solving the problem of financing educational institutions" and they are talking about the legalization of this funding through the creation of charitable foundations [9, p. 280–281]. However, the problems that high school graduates from

families with different social and material status have unequal conditions for obtaining higher education go to the background and are not substantively discussed.

In this regard, M. Bray noted that additional private education increases social inequality, and therefore there is a need for state supervision over this sector in order to strengthen its positive capacities and minimize negative influence. Some governments ignore shadow education, because they have other priorities, or do not know how to influence it productively. In countries where rules for regulating private supplementary education have been developed, there is often no understanding of the unpredictable consequences of such regulation. The researcher has come to the conclusion that policies around shadow education around the world need to be developed or reviewed [6, p. 3].

The conducted survey allows us to make preliminary conclusions. First of all, one should admit that shadow education, which exists in Ukraine predominantly in the form of "tutoring", is becoming widespread and has a significant impact on the academic achievement of pupils in secondary schools. These educational services satisfy most of the students and their parents. The growing popularity of additional private education suggests that parents are willing to invest money in the education of their children through this segment of the domestic educational space.

At the same time, one cannot but admit that shadow education contributes to the strengthening of social inequality and inequality of educational opportunities. Affluent families can pay for more private lessons, use the services of the most qualified tutors. As a result, children from wealthy families will be better trained and have the benefits of moving from one educational degree to another.

At the legislative level, equal access to education and equal educational opportunities is guaranteed in Ukraine. However, the problem of real equality of educational opportunities, especially at the level of higher education, is extremely relevant. One of the ways of its solution should be the transition from the factual ignoring of the shadow education by the educational authorities, which is observed at the present stage, to an effective, well-grounded regulation of the system of additional educational services.

## References

1. **Vsemirnaya** deklaratsiya o vysshem obrazovanii dlya XXI veka: podhody i prakticheskie mery. Prinyata na Vsemirnoy konferentsii YuNESKO «Vysshee obrazovanie v XXI veke: podhody i prakticheskie meryi» (Parizh, 5–9 oktyabrya 1998 g.) [World Declaration on Higher Education for the 21st Century: Visions and Actions. Adopted at the UNESCO World Conference «Higher Education in the 21st Century: Approaches and Practical Measures» (Paris, 5–9 October 1998)]. *Alma Mater (Herald of Higher School)*. 1999. No. 3. Pp. 29–35. (rus)
2. **Education** in a Hidden Marketplace: Monitoring of Private Tutoring / Education Support Program (ESP) of the Open Society Institute. Budapest, 2006. 355 p.
3. **Zahoruyko L. O.** Stratehiyi zabezpechennya rivnykh osvitnikh mozhlyvostey molodi u skandynavs'kykh krayinakh [Strategies of Ensuring Equal Educational Opportunities of Youth in Scandinavian Countries] : avtoref. dys. ... kand. ped. nauk : spets. 13.00.01 – zahal'na pedahohika ta istoriya pedahohiky. Sumy, *SumDPU im. A. S. Makarenka*. 2012. 20 p. (ukr)
4. **Lokshyna O. I.** Zmist shkil'noyi osvity v krayinakh Yevropeys'koho Soyuzu: teoriya i praktyka (druha polovyna XX – pochatok XXI st.) [Contents of school education in the countries of the European Union: theory and practice (second half of the XX – beginning of the XXI century)] : monohrafiya. Kyiv. 2009. 404 p. (ukr)
5. **Bray M.** and Lykins Ch. Shadow education: Private supplementary tutoring and its implications for policy makers in Asia. Mandaluyong City, Philippines: *Asian Development Bank*. 2012. 114 p.
6. **Bray M.** and Kwo O. Regulating Private Tutoring for Public Good Policy Options for Supplementary Education in Asia. Comparative Education Research Centre The University of Hong Kong. 2014. 105 p.
7. **Khmelevs'ka O. M.** Repetytorstvo yak skladova tin'ovoyi osvity ta mozhlyvosti yoho otsinyuvannya v Ukrayini [Tutoring as a component of the shadow

education and approaches to its assessment in Ukraine]. *Demohrafiya ta sotsial'na ekonomika*. 2017. # 1. – Pp. 37–53. (ukr)

8. **Bray M.** Private supplementary tutoring: comparative perspectives on patterns and implications. *Compare*. Vol. 36. No. 4. December 2006. Pp. 515–530.

9. **Sas N. M.** Al'ternatyvni dzherela finansuvannya osvity [Alternative sources of educational financing]. *Vytoky pedahohichnoyi maysternosti*. 2009. Issue 6. Pp. 280–284. Access mode: [http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/vpm\\_2009\\_6\\_62](http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/vpm_2009_6_62). (ukr)

Ваховський Л. Ц., Бочарова О. А.

Тіньова освіта в Україні та проблема рівності освітніх можливостей

У статті розкрито сутність тіньової освіти, розглянуто її зміст, форми, методи, ступінь розповсюдженості в Україні, показано наслідки поширення приватних додаткових занять щодо забезпечення рівності освітніх можливостей.

Тіньова освіта розглядається як платні освітні послуги, що надаються учням у додаток до предметів навчального плану загальноосвітніх шкіл. Підкреслено, що метафора «тіньова освіта» використовується для того, щоб показати, що приватне додаткове навчання копіює основну шкільну освіту, слідує за нею наче тінь.

На основі опитування 300 студентів першого курсу Луганського національного університету імені Тараса Шевченка (м. Старобільськ) отримано дані щодо розповсюдженості додаткової приватної освіти в Україні не в загальнодержавному, а в регіональному вимірі. Це дало змогу отримати більш точну уяву про зовнішні чинники, які сприяють її поширенню. Встановлено кількість першокурсників, які користувались послугами приватної додаткової освіти, з'ясовано особливості змісту, форм і методів приватної додаткової освіти, зв'язку навчальних занять репетиторів із шкільною програмою навчання, характер мотивації учнів при отриманні додаткових освітніх послуг.

Доведено, що тіньова освіта, яка в Україні існує переважно в формі «репетиторства», набуває поширення, суттєво впливає на академічні досягнення учнів загальноосвітніх шкіл і сприяє підсиленню соціальної нерівності та нерівності освітніх можливостей.

*Ключові слова:* тіньова освіта, репетиторство, приватне додаткове навчання, рівність освітніх можливостей.

Ваховский Л. Ц., Бочарова О. А.

Теневое образование в Украине и проблема равенства образовательных возможностей

В статье раскрыта сущность теневого образования, рассмотрены его содержание, формы, методы, степень распространенности в Украине, показаны последствия распространения частных дополнительных занятий, их влияние на обеспечение равенства образовательных возможностей.

Теневое образование рассматривается как платные образовательные услуги, предоставляемые ученикам в дополнение к школьным предметам. Подчеркнуто, что метафора «теневое образование» используется для того, чтобы показать, что частное дополнительное обучение копирует основную школьное образование, следует за ним как тень.

На основе опроса 300 студентов первого курса Луганского национального университета имени Тараса Шевченко (г. Старобельск) получены данные о распространенности дополнительной частного образования в Украине не в общегосударственном, а в региональном измерении. Установлено количество первокурсников, которые пользовалась услугами частного дополнительного образования, выяснены особенности содержания, форм и методов частного дополнительного образования, характер мотивации учащихся при получении дополнительных образовательных услуг.

Доказано, что теневое образование, которое в Украине существует преимущественно в форме «репетиторства», получает распространение, существенно влияет на академические достижения учащихся общеобразовательных школ и способствует усилению социального неравенства и неравенства образовательных возможностей.

*Ключевые слова:* теневое образование, репетиторство, частное дополнительное обучение, равенство образовательных возможностей.

#### Information about the authors

*Leonid Tsezarevych Vakhovsky* – Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences, Professor; Head of the Department of Social Work, Luhansk Taras Shevchenko National University. Circle of scientific interests: philosophy of education, methodology of historical and pedagogical research, comparative and international education.

*Olena Anatoliivna Bocharova* – Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences, Associate Professor; Professor of the Department of Psychology and Humanities, Andrzej Frycz Modrzewski Krakow University (Poland). Circle of scientific interests: comparative pedagogy, training and education of gifted students.

The article was received by the Editorial Office on 26.02.2018

The article was put into print on 30.03.2018